

**NDT Committee Meeting Notes**  
**3/26/09**

District 1: Dave Arnett / Greg Achten  
District 2: Aaron Hardy  
District 3: Eric Morris  
District 4:  
District 5: Will Repko  
District 6: Michael Hester  
District 7: Michael Hall  
District 8: Dallas Perkins  
District 9:  
AFA E: Tim O'Donnell  
AFA W: Sarah Partlow Lefevre  
AFA MW: Ron Stevenson  
AFA S: Ed Lee

Also present – Glen Frappier, Jake Thompson

**I. Approval of Minutes from Northwestern NDT Committee meetings.**

Approved

**II. Chair's Report – O'Donnell**

1. Board
2. Conference information – Loudon will provide

**III. Board of Trustees - Hall**

New Chair – Robin Rowland

Return to the old contract model. Host school would negotiate the contract, the host school would be named on the contract.

Encourage participation at the summer debate support.

Excitement that John Fritch is interest in being the chair for a longer term.

**Treasurer's Report – S.Hall**

Problems with recent problems in terms of hotel contract and additional charges being asked of the NDT. Future follow-up based on post tournament review.

Federal recognition of sales tax exempt status – problems with individual states recognizing this application. Last Monday informed that not accepted in state of Texas. Legal support for expedited review.

Still actively involved with the hosting process, want to assist hosts in this process. Just trying to solve this bottom line, tax-exempt process, and to further the long-term relationship with the local host.

One day worth of rounds in the hotel – not originally expected.

Strong presumption against a bid with a day's worth of prelim round debating at the tournament hotel, unless the tournament host is willing to absorb those costs.

#### **IV. Tournament Director's Report - Fritch**

2010 Dates from Achten –  
Registration – 3/19  
Tournament – 3/20-23

Proposed dates –  
Email from John

Discussion of 2/4 – earlier process  
Alternate process of reducing 2<sup>nd</sup> round ranking data  
Conflict with the Emory and BF

#### Proposed schedule

First Round Applications due 2/11  
Announce 2/15

Dec intent 2/16  
Prelim alloc 2/17

Weekends of 20/21 and 27/28 for districts

Deadline 2<sup>nd</sup> round applications - 3/1  
Announcement March, 4 (Thursday)

#### **Approved - Unanimously**

Fritch – interest in long-term planning to allow this basic schedule in future years

Not announce round 2 as traditionally done

Rd 1 announced. Rd 2 released between 15-30 minutes from conclusion of speaking time from rd 1.

Tomorrow – most of the debates on the 6<sup>th</sup> floor

Will clarify to bring evidence to first floor or 6<sup>th</sup> floor

Judging

- 1) Free strikes (under 12 debates) – added to categories without increasing the number of required judges.
- 2) Judge placement using Larson's ordinals to place judges and then convert to categories. Finally, review to make sure panels comply with NDT standards.
- 3) Historical interest in not innovating at the NDT to avoid unexpected problems.
- 4) Edwards – Making changes because we believe it can improve judge assignments.
- 5) Perkins – Committee will be asked about concessions for judging to host schools. Will need advice from Fritch and data
  - a. Fritch – Traditionally host always provided judging. Only exceptions are scouting (which districts cover) and Loudon (as photographer)
- 6) Discussion of using ordinals for elims. Not yet, want to work through the system first before using it all of the way through.

## **V. Host Report – Rollins**

## **VI. Future Host Report – Hall**

## **VII. Committee Reports**

A. Standing Subcommittee on Tournament Procedures: Smith (Chair), Edwards, Brusckke, Stables, Partlow, Larson, M. Hall

B. Standing Subcommittee on District Bid Allocation: Partlow-Lefevre (Chair), Morris, and Cram-Helwich

C. Standing Subcommittee on Appeals: Perkins (Chair), Hall, Arnett, Morris, Stannard

D. Standing Subcommittee Committee on Media: Perkins, Morris, M. Hall

E Ad Hoc Committee on Tournament Hosts: Perkins, Arnett, and Smith

Perkins – UTD 2011 progress  
Looking at 2012 and beyond

Stables - Interest in collaborating. CEDA would like further consultation

Perkins – Communicate to membership for folks interested both tournaments. Perhaps raise the issue with potential hosts.

O'Donnell – Larger organizational discussion for debate summit, survey membership.

F. Ad Hoc Committee on Scouting: Ed Lee, Becky Opsata.

G. Electronic Bid Coordinator: Brusckke

H. Topic Selection Representative: Mancuso

I. Rankings Director: Hanson

J. Tournament Archivist: Bellon

K. Web Director: Stables

## **IX. Old Business**

## **X. New Business**

Districting.

Stables – Consistent with goal of Wake Forest redistricting conversation , programs initiated and supported this move.

Partlow – question of ENMU to district three.

Stables – Process vs. substance – ENMU did not provide feedback to move.

Perkins – Could they be moved later?

Thompson – Contingent move.

Perkins – Minutes should reflect support for an ENMU move.

Hardy – Logistical question – representation. Who occupies the seat.

O'Donnell – A new election would be needed.

Repko – Is there a problem with an even number of voters.

O'Donnell – Not a problem with the historical record. 13<sup>th</sup> vote has abstained. Chair could be moved to not be a member.

Motion passes – Unanimous approval.

Perkins – Resolution – Based on reports of ENMU interests, the NDT committee would welcome a petition by schools in New Mexico to move to D3 to help support these programs (travel logistics, costs, safety, etc.) .

Motion passes unanimously.

AFA Code.

Morris – Challenges for this body, the larger membership, and the AFA.

Specific changes as noted in the document, citations, tournament revenue, odd number round tournament.

Questions about sharing of video content – will require further conversation within the committee and our community.

Question of research responsibilities – still to include the primary responsibility of students to research.

Hester – Question of significant coaching relationship. Is this designed to continue to make this bi-directional (i.e, either party could have coached).

- Broad support for this idea

M.Hall – Consistent with language of all of the preamble. Consistency of the rest of the document, i.e, why does the organization only clarify to the district tournaments and the NDT. Would like that forwarded to the AFA.

Partlow – question of liability concerns.

Stables – CEDA jurisdiction currently extended to all tournaments that are CEDA sanctioned.

Hester – question of what is an AFA sanctioned tournament. What part of Article 4 makes this case for a larger jurisdiction? Would legislation be desirable or possible to change this jurisdiction.

O'Donnell - Article 4, Section 3 – Should it be struck?

M.Hall – should it instead be worded generically (not only to sponsored tournaments)

Hester – Inconsistency with AFA members and then to those events.

S.Hall – Agreement with this inconsistency of jurisdiction.

O'Donnell – sense of the committee - Consistency – apply to beyond just the NDT.

Forward along the working document to the AFA president.

Thanks to the committee for their work on this process.

Eligibility.

Perkins proposal

Two problems –

- 1) Post-tournament eligibility

Resolve date with April 15<sup>th</sup>.

Quarterfinals and top speakers.

Report back

Hanson concern about year-long eligibility. Relationship of at-large bids to year-long applicability.

Partlow – question of extenuating circumstance beyond the NDT.

Hardy – question of momentum and gatekeepers of entire year

Stables – question of logistics

Hester – problem of today

Helwich – schools not in session over tournament dates.

Perkins – Interest in crafting this more broadly. Need data.

Hall – Use of common sense.

Stables – question of streamlined. Beginning of prior academic term.

Repko – Huge workability problems. Significant progress with April post-tournament verification.

April amendment

Repko - These thresholds help to deter academic irregularity.

**Amend** to “Within two weeks of the conclusion of the tournament each year, all students”

**Amend** to “The NDT chair should promptly report to the membership to the results of the verification process.”

Question of enforcement – Repko - support for different models of enforcement

**Amend** to “Violations of the duty to verify eligibility will be subject to review and sanctions by the NDT governing bodies.”

Not moving to correct the provisions under ‘G.’

**Vote on H - Motion passes unanimously**

Goes into effect for future –

Not interest in pursuing A and G.

- 2) Responsibility under the charter to define eligibility  
NDT document largely self-referential back to AFA documents (which provide responsibility to the NDT to define these criteria)  
Need additional thought to define what is eligible.  
Should make sure that item G is not enough to exhaust eligibility.  
Basic requirement of A not reduced by the procedural requirements of G.

## **XI. Discussion Items**

### **Eligibility documents -**

Does the chair need an original document?

Is the organization ok with the electronic submission?

Security of that site

O’Donnell – the direction of the committee

SQ remains

No online submission via the website

**Voting on the website – Fritch – Appears easier for the voters**

O’Donnell –

1. Makes the voting process more likely to create errors
2. Adds the additional step

Security concerns about students at their schools’ voting.  
Broader security concerns

**Action item for Jon:** Need to create committee passwords

## **Hybrid rule**

### **What is means to 'participate' in districts?**

Perkins – Support for current approach.

Partlow – Support for individual number of rounds.

Repko – Concern about 2<sup>nd</sup> round bid application eligibility as well.

Morris – Support for robust appeals, seems like major concern is addressing teams that would never intend to register in the first place.

Perkins – Equal chance to get out of districts, provides rationale for specific system.

### **Partlow – Changing the call in standard to after two rounds.**

Repko – Situation of inflated 2<sup>nd</sup> round pool based on this kind of situations.

Repko – Idea of district qual eligible teams, instead of those bids relocating to districts those bids would be additional 2<sup>nd</sup> round slots.

M.Davis – question of phantom teams and would that be incentivized.

Require for membership at the summer conference.

## **Elections**

### **Topic Rep**

Up at end of next year. End of 2010 academic calendar.

Understanding that the term will expire at the end of the term

## **Chair**

Tim, will do for one more year

Next chair will need to do post-tournament certification

Perkins - 2 year terms of districts

Need to clarify the calendar

D1 – Greg Achten – elected in 2009

D2 – Aaron Hardy assumed duties 2008.

D3 – Ero – elected in 2008

D4 – DCH assumed duties in 2008

D5 – Ron/Will elected cochairs in 2008. Repko assumes sole through 10

D6 – Hester elected in 2008

D7 – Mike Hall elected in 2009

D8 – Perkins elected in 2009

D9 – Partlow elected in 2008.

Need District 2/9 will need to have an election for June 1, 2009.

Need to have a constitution

AFA Reps – solely at discretion of AFA presidents. 2 year terms. All four representatives renewed in 2009.